

Report to the Cabinet



Report reference: C-067-2013/14

Date of meeting: 3 February 2014

**Epping Forest
District Council**

Portfolio: Housing

Subject: Construction of Off Street Parking on Housing Land – Review of Rankings for Future Schemes & Review of Capital Expenditure.

Responsible Officer: Paul Pledger (01992 564248)

Democratic Services Officer: Gary Woodhall (01992 564470)

Recommendations/Decisions Required:

- (1) That the updated ranking table for future off-street parking schemes at Appendix 1 be agreed;**
- (2) That the outcome of the post-construction review of the most recently completed schemes in Loughton at Barfields Gardens and the scheme at Avenue Road, Theydon Bois be noted;**
- (3) That for sites where there are no Council-owned properties, then these sites be excluded from the programme and are removed from the list;**
- (4) That detailed feasibility studies be undertaken on the next ten schemes in the updated ranking table at Queens Road, North Weald; Ladyfield Close, Loughton; St Peters Avenue, Ongar; Roxwell House, Buckhurst Hill; Stanway Road, Waltham Abbey; Paley Gardens, Loughton; Fullers Close, Waltham Abbey; Woodford Court, Waltham Abbey and Badburgham Court, Waltham Abbey; and that planning applications be submitted and they be constructed, subject to:
 - (a) the successful grant of planning consent;**
 - (b) the average cost per bay being no more than £5,000; and**
 - (c) the works and fees being able to be delivered within the existing Capital Programme budget;****
- (5) That , subject to recommendation 3 above, if the Cabinet agrees to exclude schemes with no Council owned properties, then schemes with a score of 14, including Park Square, Lambourne End and Pyrles Lane, Loughton be added to the list instead;**
- (6) That each scheme be funded from the HRA and the General Fund based on the percentage split between Council and private properties respectively as assessed at the time of the works commencing on site;**
- (7) That it be noted that subject to recommendation 6 above being approved, and the the General Fund budget being finite, then the programme may come to an end in 2017/18 and before the list at Appendix 1 is completed;**

(8) That the scheme at Centre Avenue/Green, Epping retains its status on the priority list pending the outcome of the ECC Consultation on Residents Parking in the future;

(9) That the scheme at Western Avenue, Epping be put on hold and retain its place on the list pending the same ECC Consultation on Residents Parking as Centre Avenue/Green, Epping in recommendation 7 above; and

(10) That the Council's Policy of not allocating bays to individual properties at completed sites be confirmed.

Executive Summary:

Commencing in April 2011, the Cabinet has approved a succession of off-street parking schemes on Housing land across the district, undertaken in priority order based on an approved list of sites. At its meeting in December 2012, the Cabinet agreed to undertake feasibility studies, consult residents, submit planning applications and construct a number of schemes (where approval was granted), all subject to the cost per bay being below £5k. This report sets out progress achieved in delivering the programme to date and seeks approval of the updated ranking table attached at Appendix 1, as well as approval to progress with the next ten schemes on the list.

Reasons for Proposed Decision:

This report is presented at the request of the Cabinet, following its decisions to approve construction at a limited number of sites on the Off-Street Parking Programme since in April 2011. The Cabinet seeks to approve schemes only after assessing the effectiveness of the work undertaken on previously approved schemes, taking account of the cost and benefit. In order to progress with any further schemes, and in order to divert adequate resources to manage the Off-Street Parking Programme, which is one of the most resource intensive programmes within the Housing Assets Section, a Cabinet decision is sought, committing to both the updated ranking table and the capital expenditure.

Other Options for Action:

- (a) Not to undertake the construction of the further off street parking bays. However, this would not resolve the parking problems recognised during recent parking surveys.
- (b) To progress with a different number of schemes than proposed in the report. However, should the number be less than proposed, it may mean reporting back to the Cabinet sooner, as it is likely that some schemes will not actually be feasible for any number of reasons, including residents not being in favour; planning approval not being granted; the cost per bay exceeding £5k or there not being sufficient land available to facilitate a scheme.
- (c) To seek approval from the Cabinet on a stage by stage basis. However, this would lead to an increase in the frequency of future reports to the Cabinet.
- (d) To include schemes where there are no longer any Council properties. However, this would open up the whole of the district for assessment, and where found to score highly, proceed to site.
- (e) To continue to fund the works based on the average 51:49 ratio split between the HRA and the General Fund, irrespective of how many sold properties there are in each street.

Report:

1. In April 2011, the Cabinet agreed to commence an off street parking programme, which has seen schemes constructed at:

- Colebrook Gardens, Loughton;
- School Lane, Abbess Roding;
- Hillcroft, Loughton;
- Chester Close, Loughton;
- Harvey Gardens, Loughton;
- Audley Gardens, Loughton;
- Barfields Gardens, Loughton; and
- Avenue Road, Theydon Bois.

2. Planning approval has also been achieved for schemes at Parndon House, Buckhurst Hill and Harveyfields, Waltham Abbey, with work due to commence on site in January 2014 and March 2014 respectively. A further scheme at Centre Avenue/Green, Epping has been put on hold pending the outcome of a consultation by Essex County Council on Resident Parking.

3. To date, the Council has constructed a total of 130 off-street parking bays at a total cost of £499,755 inclusive of works costs and fees, which on average equates to around £3,844 per bay. All schemes have been completed on time and within budget.

4. Of the schemes approved by the Cabinet in December 2012, it has not been possible to identify any housing land suitable to deliver a viable off-street parking scheme at Grosvenor Close, Loughton. Also, Gravel Close, Chigwell Row has previously benefited from an off-street parking scheme and there is no housing land available to extend that scheme any further.

Review of Completed Off-Street Parking Schemes

5. At its meeting in October 2011, the Cabinet asked that a review of completed off-street parking schemes be undertaken, to assess the success or otherwise to give the Cabinet reassurance that the investment represented value for money.

6. For the purpose of assessment, each completed site was re-surveyed and scored in the same way as other pre-works sites are scored and ranked to establish if the provision of off-street parking has overcome the problems initially observed. Residents were also consulted by way of a Resident Satisfaction Survey.

7. From Appendix 1, it can be seen that the off street parking schemes that have been completed have made a positive improvement to the parking situation at each of the sites. The scores achieved for each of the schemes after the works have been completed would place them significantly lower on the ranking table.

8. The Resident Satisfaction Survey based on a sliding scale between 1-10 with 1 being "Totally Dissatisfied" and 10 being "Totally Satisfied" undertaken at the completion of the works at Barfields Gardens, Loughton and Avenue Road, Theydon Bois returned the following results:

- an average score of 7.8 was returned when residents were asked to rate how satisfied were they with the overall quality of the works; and
- an average score of 8.0 was returned when residents were asked to rate the overall improvement in parking in the area.

9. It is worth noting that, in virtually all returned surveys, residents have commented that they are disappointed that they have not been allocated an individual parking space as part of

the works. However such an approach has never been adopted by the Council since allocated parking significantly reduces the effectiveness of the schemes (since bays allocated to residents would not be used when the resident is out or away), where by definition, off street parking provision needs to be available. Furthermore, the number of bays at each site is less than the number of residents.

10. The latest financial profile is given in the table below. This shows actual expenditure in 2012/13 and the current budget allocation for Off-Street Parking schemes within the Capital Programme:

	2012/13 (Actual) £000	2013/14 (Revised) £000	2014/15 (Forecast) £000	2015/16 (Forecast) £000	2016/17 (Forecast) £000	2017/18 (Forecast) £000	Total £000
HRA	85	155	218	218	218	220	1,114
General Fund	82	150	209	209	209	208	1,067
Revised Total	167	305	427	427	427	428	2,181

11. Of the overall budget from 2013/14 onwards, as shown in the table above, the anticipated expenditure for the planned schemes at Parndon House, Buckhurst Hill and Harveyfields, Waltham Abbey is £212,825 and the estimated costs for Centre Avenue/Green, Epping, should the scheme progress is £61,579, which leaves a budget of £2,181,000 for future Off-Street Parking schemes up to March 2018.

12. Based on the tenders to date, as a guideline, the average cost per bay for a standard scheme, without any complications or adverse conditions, and including all fees is around £4,625 per bay.

13. The list of off street parking schemes at Appendix 1 has been reviewed and updated with the latest information available. Should the Cabinet be minded to maintain its commitment to the current budget provision of the Off-Street Parking Programme, it is recommended that the top 10 parking schemes be drawn down in the priority order from the revised ranking table at Appendix 1 for detailed design up to and including obtaining planning consent, and that they be constructed, subject to the average cost per bay being under £5,000 and the programme being delivered within the existing Capital Programme.

14. The Cabinet's attention is drawn to the site at Chester Path, Loughton, which is ranked within the top ten sites, yet no longer has any Council-owned properties, as all properties in that street have been sold under the Right to Buy. If the Cabinet is minded to undertake an off-street parking scheme in Chester Path, it would create a precedent that would mean undertaking schemes in other areas where there are no Council properties. Therefore it is recommended that those streets that do not have any Council properties in them are excluded and removed from the list altogether. This would mean adding Park Square, Lambourne End and Pyrles Lane, Loughton to the next programme of schemes to make up the 10 sites in the recommendations above.

15. Subject to paragraph 14 above, Western Avenue, Epping would also in the top schemes for inclusion in the next phase of off street parking schemes. However, since Western Avenue is adjacent to Centre Avenue/Green, it is recommended that this site be held over until ECC complete their Resident Parking Consultation exercise, with the site being held on the list until the outcome is known.

16. Funding for the Off-Street Parking Programme is jointly funded by both the HRA and the General Fund, and in the past this has been split based on a 51:49 ratio, to reflect the proportion of Council properties compared to the number of Right to Buys across the district. However, in line with good accounting procedure, it is recommended that in future, the funding

split be calculated on a scheme by scheme basis, with schemes completed in 2013/14 also being funded on this basis. This will make predicting when the Off-Street Programme will come to an end as the General Fund Budget may be used up before the list at Appendix 1 is completed.

Resource Implications:

The overall remaining budget within the Capital Programme for the installation of off street parking bays is a total of £2,181,000 as set out in the table above. The anticipated expenditure for the schemes at Parndon House, Buckhurst Hill and Harveyfields, Waltham Abbey is £212,825 and the estimated costs for Centre Avenue/Green should the scheme progress is £61,579, which leaves a budget of £1,906,596 for future Off-Street Parking schemes.

Legal and Governance Implications:

Housing Act 1985.

Safer, Cleaner and Greener Implications:

Sites for future off-street parking have been assessed, taking account of access for emergency vehicles and waste lorries, as well as damage caused to green verges and open spaces.

Consultation Undertaken:

All residents in the vicinity of the schemes at Barfields Gardens and Avenue Road have been consulted on the design options. Local Ward Members have also been consulted.

Consultation with residents for future schemes will be consulted as part of any feasibility study.

ECC Highways have also been consulted, since some of the schemes will result in the parking bays becoming adopted for future maintenance by ECC Highways.

Background Papers:

Previous Cabinet decisions in September 2008, April 2011, October 2011 and December 2012

Impact Assessments:

Refer to Due Regard Record.

The main risks to the Council are that:

The contract to construct the off-street parking schemes has been developed to allow a continuation of work by using SOR's. However, the contract has annual break clauses so that there is no commitment to undertake any further works.

A safety audit is undertaken as part of the design stage, and this is agreed with ECC Highways as part of the consultation process.

All public utility companies are consulted to establish the extent and position of all underground services, so that the Council can minimise the risk of incurring unexpected costs when works commence.

As with all works procured by the Council, contractors are paid for work completed and not in advance. This means that if the Contractor goes into administration part-way through a contract, then the Council would have to step in and complete the works, but would not have

over-paid.

Appendix 1

Off Street Parking Rating Table 2013-14										
This table includes schemes that have been reassessed under the new assessment procedure by the Housing Assets Section. The locations are listed in priority scoring.										
Location:	Area:	Status:	Q1	Q2	Q3	Q4	Q5	Q6	Q7	Total Score
Centre Avenue/Green	Epping	Surveyed	5	3	Yes	5	5	3	1	22
Update: Currently on-hold until the results of an Essex County Council consultation on Resident Parking.										
Parndon House	Buckhurst Hill	Surveyed	8	5	Yes	4	4	0	0	21
Update: Scheme in for Planning Permission with a start on site March 2014										
Wormyngford Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	10	3	No	5	1	2	0	21
Update: Mature trees in landscaped garden area, limited land available - On hold pending a change in circumstances										
Harveyfields	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	10	5	Yes	3	1	0	1	20
Update: Scheme in for Planning Permission with a start on site January 2014										
Queens Road	North Weald	Surveyed	5	4	Yes	4	1	2	1	17
Ladyfield Close	Loughton	Surveyed	3	5	Yes	6	3	0	0	17
St Peters Avenue	Ongar	Surveyed	8	4	No	3	0	0	1	16
Roxwell House	Buckhurst Hill	Surveyed	3	5	No	4	4	0	0	16
Stanway Road	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	3	5	No	3	5	0	0	16
Paley Gardens	Loughton	Surveyed	4	3	No	6	1	0	1	15
Chester Path	Loughton	Surveyed	0	3	No	6	3	3	0	15
Fullers Close	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	8	2	No	3	1	0	0	14
Woodford Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	6	3	No	3	1	0	1	14
Badburgham Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	5	5	No	3	0	1	0	14
Western Avenue	Epping	Surveyed	4	2	No	4	4	0	0	14
Park Square (New Road)	Lambourne End	Surveyed	3	5	No	3	0	2	1	14
Pyrlas Lane	Loughton	Surveyed	3	3	No	3	4	0	1	14
Alderwood Close	Abridge	Surveyed	8	1	No	4	0	0	0	13
Tillingham Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	7	2	No	3	0	0	1	13
Sycamore House	Buckhurst Hill	Surveyed	5	5	No	2	1	0	0	13
Millfield	Ongar	Surveyed	4	4	No	4	0	0	1	13
Chester Green	Loughton	Surveyed	4	0	No	6	2	1	0	13
Graylands	Theydon Bois	Surveyed	3	1	No	4	2	3	0	13
Parkfields	Roydon	Surveyed	3	1	No	4	4	0	1	13
Shrublands Close	Chigwell	Surveyed	0	4	No	4	2	2	1	13
Torrington Drive	Loughton	Surveyed	7	2	No	2	0	1	0	12
Borders Lane	Loughton	Surveyed	3	3	No	1	4	0	1	12
Colson Path	Loughton	Surveyed	3	1	No	6	2	0	0	12
Millhoo Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	3	5	No	3	1	0	0	12
Foxley Close	Loughton	Surveyed	2	5	No	5	0	0	0	12
Buxton Road	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	5	1	No	4	1	0	0	11
Caterham Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	4	3	No	3	1	0	0	11
Newmans Lane	Loughton	Surveyed	3	2	No	2	3	0	1	11
Amwell Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	3	2	No	3	2	0	1	11
Coopers Close	Chigwell	Surveyed	2	0	No	4	2	2	1	11
Princesfield Road	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	4	1	No	4	1	0	0	10
Hanson Close	Loughton	Surveyed	3	2	No	4	1	0	0	10
Skarning Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	2	3	No	3	1	0	1	10
Stewards Green Road	Epping	Surveyed	5	1	No	3	0	0	0	9
Sudicamps Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	4	3	No	2	0	0	0	9
Morris Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	4	1	No	3	1	0	0	9
Greenfields	Loughton	Surveyed	3	0	No	4	2	0	0	9
Theydon Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	3	3	No	3	0	0	0	9
Barnmead, Toot Hill	Toot Hill	Surveyed	2	5	No	2	0	0	0	9
Blackmore Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	2	3	No	4	0	0	0	9
Bridge Hill	Epping	Surveyed	2	1	No	2	1	3	0	9
The Croft	Loughton	Surveyed	2	2	No	3	0	2	0	9
Wrangley Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	2	3	No	4	0	0	0	9
Coles Green	Loughton	Surveyed	0	3	No	5	1	0	0	9
Hansells Mead	Roydon	Surveyed	4	0	No	3	1	0	0	8
Maynard Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	3	1	No	3	1	0	0	8
Plumtree Mead	Loughton	Surveyed	3	3	No	2	0	0	0	8
Green Glade	Theydon Bois	Surveyed	3	1	No	3	1	0	0	8
Bromefield Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	1	4	No	3	0	0	0	8
Winters Way	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	3	0	No	3	1	0	0	7
Blackmore Road	Buckhurst Hill	Surveyed	1	2	No	3	1	0	0	7
Collard Green	Loughton	Done	3	1	Done	5	0	0	0	9
Barfields Gardens	Loughton	Done	5	0	Done	4	1	0	0	10
Avenue Road	Theydon Bois	Done	7	0	Done	2	0	0	0	9
Colebrook Gardens	Loughton	Done	0	1	Done	3	1	2	1	8
Hillcroft	Loughton	Done	0	1	Done	3	0	0	1	5
School Lane	Abbess Roding	Done	0	0	Done	2	0	0	1	3
Gravel Close	Loughton	Surveyed	No Housing land for improvements							
Grosvenor Close	Loughton	Surveyed	Limited scope as scheme already completed							
Colson Gardens	Loughton	Surveyed	Limited scope as scheme already completed							
Loughton Court	Waltham Abbey	Surveyed	No Housing land for improvements							
The Chestnuts	Abridge	Surveyed	No Housing land for improvements							
Q1 - (max score 10)	Percentage of council tenants.									
Q2 - (max score 5)	Lack of off street parking									
Q3 - (max score 3)	Consultation undertaken with residents									
Q4 - (max score 7)	Road width									
Q5 - (max score 5)	Verge/footway damage									
Q6 - (max score 3)	Accident risk to pedestrians/drivers									
Q7 - (max score 1)	Special parking requirements									
Max score available 34										

The ranking table does take into account any technical or legal issues known at the time the initial assessments were undertaken, it does not take into account any technical or legal matters that may arise as part of a more detailed feasibility study, which may mean that some of these schemes may not actually be possible.